British Forum for Ethnomusicology

Annual Conference, 14-16 April 2000

University of Sheffield

Fieldwork, Ethnography, Representation

Abstracts

Conference Panel

Julia Bishop
Ruth Davis
Lee Tong Soon
Chair: Jonathan Stock

The British Forum for Ethnomusicology is the UK National Committee of the International Council for Traditional Music

Session 1 The Other

"Herehome" (*Itthon*) and "Therehome" (*Otthon*): Place, Identity, Shifting Boundaries and Ethnomusicological Field Research

To me, as a Hungarian who has lived in Britain for over twenty-five years and carried out research amongst the Hungarian Roma for the last seventeen years, the idea long associated with ethnomusicology, that is, "studying the exotic Other in a far away place," now increasingly under attack, has always felt limiting and a somewhat false concept. In this paper I will discuss, in relation to my specific geographical location, how the ostensibly fixed categories of "home" and "research" have been transformed into a constantly changing flux of interconnected spaces, with each space a complex of elements that feed into one another, in an unending quest to grasp the essence of ethnomusicology's concerns with musical interaction, identities, boundaries and space.

Irén Kertész-Wilkinson
ikertesz@atlas.co.uk

Experiencing Fieldwork: A Native Researcher's View

The aim of doing fieldwork is writing culture. Methodologies of writing style and attitudes toward culture have been debated in various dimensions (see, for example, Barz and Cooley 1997). Nevertheless, such considerations have mainly been contributed by scholars who study other people's music, who come from elsewhere, who learn through relatively bounded periods of "fieldwork", and who leave after having finished their field research. Distance, whether geographical, cultural or deliberately constructed, certainly lends these researchers a perspective from to reflect on issues of ethics, human rights, transmission, gender difference and so forth. However, the so-called "native researcher" may approach his or her research from a different viewpoint, and this is one that seems insufficiently explored in the theoretical literature of ethnomusicology at present.

In this paper, I will draw on my fieldwork experiences, in which I have found myself combining the identities of a learner, musician and a researcher. Finally, I will discuss how my experience of learning music at home both overlaps and contrasts with models established by non-native scholars.

Gregory F. Barz and Timothy J. Cooley, eds. *Shadows in the Field: New Perspectives for Fieldwork in Ethnomusicology* (New York, 1997).

Chien-Er Chou
University of Sheffield
mup98cc@sheffield.ac.uk

Problems of the Diaspora Field—The Others' Other

I am researching music of the Korean community in China towards a PhD. I question whether I am dealing with representations of a diaspora or a (recent) native community. Until the 1990s the Korean Autonomous Prefecture Yanbian remained very much a Chinese field—writings on Chinese Koreans treated them in the context of China's minority policies, except in historical studies of the Korean anti-Japanese movement. The resumption of ties with South Korea has brought a whole new set of studies, mainly from South Korean scholars, seeing the Chinese Koreans as an interesting offshoot of the Korean race, with less concern for the Chinese context. Others see them as a gateway to understanding North Korea. The former approach is obviously inadequate, the latter also fail to take full account of the diaspora's independent identity.

As an outsider to both cultures I constructed the field first as Chinese-other and then Korean-other, a shift the Yanbian community has itself experienced this decade. And just as they may represent themselves differently to Chinese and Korean researchers, I try approaching informants by suggesting intimacy with both cultures, despite abysmal spoken Korean, and seeing which works best. Yes, I know the story of Chunhyang. Yes, I can sing "The East is Red." (And when all else fails, I play a fieldworker's trump card—I'm white and my children have a Chinese-Korean father.) This in turn impacts on the informant's self-representation—we shift like people trying to pass in a corridor.

In this paper I discuss whether it is necessary to disentangle what of the diaspora's music has roots in ethnic heritage, what in citizenship. It can be pre-occupying even when it is irrelevant to the insider. Yet in a community just 50 years old can you ignore it?

Rowan Pease
SOAS
rowan@jrpease.freeserve.co.uk

Session 2 Fieldwork Past and Future: Its Shaping Influence

Forty Thousand Miles in Quest of Ballads: James M. Carpenter as a Folksong Fieldworker

James Madison Carpenter (1888-1983), a newly graduated doctoral student of George Lyman Kittredge at Harvard, came to Britain to conduct fieldwork into traditional song in 1929. Initially funded for one year, he stayed for six, amassing one of the largest and most important British song collections ever made.

Drawing on the Collection as now housed at the Library of Congress, and also on recently discovered additional materials in Carpenter's home town in Mississippi, this paper charts the progress of Carpenter's fieldwork in Britain, his research training and adopted methods, his criteria for the selection of singers and material collected, and his relationship with singers. Comparison

with his predecessors in the field of British traditional song will be made, and particular attention paid to Carpenter's subsequent ethnographic representation of the musical cultures with which he came into contact.

Julia C. Bishop
University of Sheffield
j.c.bishop@sheffield.ac.uk

Fieldwork and History in the Study of Byzantine Chant

Greece, as Herzfeld has shown, poses special challenges to ethnographers because of the dialectical relationship that obtains between scholarship—both foreign and domestic—and the ongoing project of constructing a Modern Greek identity from the oppositions European vs. Oriental and Hellenic vs. Romaic / Byzantine. Whilst students of Greek rural and popular song are generally aware of the relevance of these issues, their importance to the study of Byzantine chant as both a historical repertory and a living tradition has not been fully recognised. Yet the intense conflicts of the past century over the interpretation of medieval Byzantine repertories between (mostly Western) musicologists employing philological methodologies and traditionalist Greek cantors are intimately connected to debates over the legitimacy of the received musical traditions. Attempts by Greeks and foreigners to validate or discredit these traditions have largely rested on tracing them to the Ancient, Byzantine or Ottoman pasts.

The present study considers the problematic status of fieldwork within the emerging scholarly consensus that familiarity with the received tradition is vital for the study of Byzantine chant of all periods. The paper begins with the cautionary tale of H. J. W. Tillyard (1881-1968), the only founding member of the Monumenta Musicae Byzantinae to have studied with a Greek cantor. In particular, it shows how Tillyard's view of the received tradition was fatally flawed by his choice of teacher, namely the Westerniser John Th. Sakellarides. Subsequently, the author's experience of learning to sing Byzantine chant forms the basis for musical and ideological analyses of the competing claims to authority proffered by contemporary schools of Greek chanting. The paper concludes with a discussion of the role played by positivist historical scholarship in the emergence within Greece of new criteria for authenticity that often effectively substitute one form of Western influence for another.

Alexander Lingas
University of Oxford
alexander.lingas@music.oxford.ac.uk

The Field and How to Work It

One of the prevailing paradigms of ethnomusicology is that of fieldwork. Throughout the last decade in anthropological writing (and, increasingly, in ethnomusicological writing) scholars have been coming to grips, in prose, with the problems of representation and reflexivity which are inherent in writing the story of another's life. Long-standing relationships between musicians and scholars are examined and mined for the insight they can give us into musical sound.

Forming the central theme of this paper is the very length and breadth of the fieldwork experience. As we go about redefining the "field," we must query whether the standard view of fieldwork, that of a lengthy relationship with the Other, is still the only mode of musical enquiry by which ethnomusicologists and other students of the world's musics may gain musical knowledge. The area studies approach and its fall from favour in the academy pushes us toward connects on a much broader level than traditional fieldwork might allow, perhaps opening the door to shorter and more concentrated ways of working in the "field."

As an American university classroom teacher, I find myself confronted with large "world music" classes in which my goal is not only to give students some empirical facts about various large areas of world music but also to allow them a forum for investigating sonic phenomena in an experiential way—through small doses of fieldwork. In this paper I problematize ways in which students might study music in an introductory class setting. Using data gleaned from eight different semesters of teaching American undergraduates at settings from small liberal arts colleges through major research universities, I offer some success stories and relative failures as I press toward a classroom approach reconfiguring field study to fit student needs, while at the same time retaining crucial ideas of context and contact.

Jerry Cadden
Boston College
cadden@bc.edu

Session 3 Issues and Instances in Fieldworking

Tibet and the Different Possibilities for Fieldwork

Tibet poses a number of unique characteristics and problems for fieldwork on the subject of Tibetan music. One of the main problems of trying to conduct fieldwork or any type of research in Tibet has been the lack of co-operation of the local Tibetans to foreigners interested in their study. From the seventh century to the 1950s Tibet has remained almost closed off to the outside world. The attitude since 1950 and the Chinese invasion of Tibet has changed the situation. The function of Tibetan music and culture over the past fifty years has changed from a religious, secretive one to a politically and economically implicated, public part of the Free Tibet campaign. This change of function has had a knock-on effect on how we conduct research into Tibetan music. We now have Tibetan monks touring the world giving concerts in concert halls, recording commercial CDs and

reaching the New Age Top 25. There has also been since 1954 onwards a large amount of research material made available, such as transcriptions. The researcher no longer has to go to Tibet to conduct fieldwork, and few have done so.

Since the Chinese invasion there has been a steady flow of refugees from Tibet to the surrounding countries. It has been among these refugees since 1950 that most of the fieldwork on Tibetan music has been done, with very little research in Tibet by Western researchers. This brings up the point of the different approaches to fieldwork taken by researchers from China and the West. Western scholars look at intercultural exchange between Tibet and other countries. On the other hand, Chinese scholars often trance back historical exchanges between Tibet and Han Chinese culture. The West considers the study of Tibet to be part of non-Western music and uses Western ethnomusicological and anthropological approaches. The Chinese consider Tibetans to be part of the ethnic minorities within China and strongly influenced by China. Chinese scholars also pay more attention to the secular side of music, especially folk music, while the West pays more attention to religious music, stressing its ritual function in counterpoint to the Chinese stress on entertainment. Finally, Tibet is not a unified culture but split up into different sects, thus making it harder to produce general characteristics for Tibetan music. Tibet thus poses a number of important questions on how we go about fieldwork.

Ian Thomas
University of Durham
ian.thomas@durham.ac.uk

Unravelling Layers of the Past: Latvian National Identity among Ethnomusicologists in Present-day Riga

Returning to an independent Latvian republic last year, I aimed to elicit which forms of traditional music had been valued, studied and performed in the decade since the dissolution of the Soviet Union. The folklore movement emerged in the 1980s as a form of political dissent which is marked by singing and has become part of a larger Latvian “folk awakening” (a term which was first applied to nineteenth-century nationalism). In addition to the revival of past forms, new styles are gaining popularity in performance: in the “post-folklore” movement, traditional ensembles in Riga, and among Latvian émigrés in the U.S., have been influenced by Celtic, jazz, minimalist, new wave and Eastern idioms.

My informants—including museum curators at the Ethnographic Open-Air Museum and the “Memorial Flat” of the nineteenth-century collector Krisjanis Barons, folklorists at the Latvian Folklore Archives, and Maris Jansons, the director of a privately-funded “Traditional Music Centre”—conduct field trips, build instruments, record, perform and offer courses. With few exceptions, their outlook is conservative; in searching for “pure forms” these Latvians are highly selective about what they view as indigenous music. Jansons, for example, emulates the rural singing and instrumental styles found in Catholic enclaves that have been subject to less acculturation. Because I rarely shared their preferences for the “ethnographically correct,” this created obstacles in communication perhaps symptomatic of fieldwork conducted among educated informants in complex, multi-ethnic societies which are fully documented historiographically.

Philip Bohlman concluded that these resurgent East European nationalisms selectively filter the "ethnomusicological past." A Hungarian ethnologist has noted, similarly, that studies of nationalist ideology remain tied to the legacy of peasant culture, ignoring the "alien" middle and upper classes. For example, the rich diversity of German, Czech and Polish urban music which nurtured the founding of Latvian musicianship from the sixteenth through the eighteenth centuries, is rarely, if ever, acknowledged. This tendency may have been introduced by Soviet scholarship in Latvia which viewed traditional music as part of rural and working-class culture.

Christina Jaremko-Porter
University of Edinburgh
c/o *j.w.porter@abdn.ac.uk*

The Recontextualisation of Barbadian *Tuk* Music

The cultural renaissance that followed Barbados gaining independence in 1966 led to a search to establish a truly Barbadian cultural identity. The revival and recontextualisation of traditions that had belonged to the working classes during three centuries of British colonialism followed. One such tradition is *tuk*, a fife and drum music which has developed from a complex interaction of influences.

My report will briefly explore the history of *tuk* before considering how *tuk* has been recontextualised from the traditional music of the working classes, played for their entertainment and generally associated with rum shops, to the musical signature of Barbados, today promulgated as the indigenous music of the country and showcased for visitors as one of the facets of Barbadian culture.

Sharon Meredith
Warwick University
sharonmeredith@allcomm.co.uk

Session 4 The Balance of Power

Fieldwork with Scottish Travelling People

Fieldwork is one of the most important and useful strategies in ethnomusicological research. Yet it has often been criticised for its association with colonialism and exploitation. For a better relationship between researchers and informants, the new term "fieldback" was introduced, which means that the results and any product of the fieldwork should be returned to the people of the field. However, an imbalance of the researcher-informant relationship will still be there unless the working process itself is open to the informants.

Recently, theorists' minds have been centred on the necessity of co-operative and interactive field research, and some successful examples have been reported elsewhere. For instance, on Amami Island, Japan, a researcher established a study group for Amami folklore, which anybody can join in, and the residents have been mostly stimulated to revitalise their own tradition. This is a lucky case however, with a sense of togetherness shared by the residents. In many cases, researcher-resident co-operation does not work well or sometimes another imbalance is formed among the residents or informants.

Scottish travellers' society, in which I have been working, used to be a very equal community for music making. Everybody sang and there were no "stars". Since researchers' first visits in 1950s, some changes have been recognised in the community. First, their diverse states of identity have been revealed. Some travellers were proud to present their singing tradition, while others were ashamed to do so for fear of exposing themselves to ridicule. Secondly, hierarchy was introduced into the previously egalitarian community when a few "stars" were accidentally found by the fieldworkers and spotlighted in the folk revival scene. Some other travellers enviously waited for their own chance and the rest had no interest in singing in front of non-travellers.

In this paper, I examine how field research can affect the balance of power between people in the field, referring to my experiences in the Scottish travellers' society.

Akiko Takamatu-Minami
Fukui University, Japan
minami@edu00.f-edu.fukui-u.ac.jp

On the Playing Fields of the World

For many of us engaged in ethnomusicological fieldwork today, our informants are no longer distant and powerless. More than ever before, we are likely to find ourselves working in areas where our "subjects" have a strong vested interest in the nature of their representation, with political implications that are potentially far-reaching and perhaps more than we had bargained for.

Some recent debate in anthropological circles has suggested that as ethnographers we should only publish work whose content and thrust has been approved by the community in question.

Considerations of our responsibilities to the wider academic community as well as to the bodies that fund us aside, this is still easier said than done. If we are now used to the idea that our "informants" might well be asking whose interests our work serves—in the sense that it is assumed to contribute towards furthering our own academic careers, if not providing us with any more direct profit—we also have to ask whose interests we might be serving within the communities we study by representing them in an "approved" manner. It is in any case a fallacy to assume that the voice of the community is unified and unanimous. Within many communities there will be dominant voices (including those who are funded, published, given a platform by the local media) and silent or suppressed voices (including those who quietly continue to go about life in their remote and often ailing villages).

In a world where those we might find variously referred to as "folk," "ethnic" or "roots" musicians are increasingly talking and writing about the "traditions" which inform their own musical activities (via press releases, festival brochures, web sites and the like), we need to keep open minds about how "real" some realities actually are; we need to listen for the sub-themes of the stories being told, the rules of the games being played (consciously or otherwise); we need to keep an eye open for axes in need of grinding, lines in need of toeing, causes in need of fighting. Even if we choose, in proper postmodern fashion, to give space to a range of complementary and conflicting voices, it is often not enough to let them stand on their own. We need, more than ever, to contextualise with respect not only to the music itself but also to where our "informants" are "coming from."

Ultimately we might have awkward choices about which causes our work might be used to further and which it might hinder. In the course of my paper I will refer to my own experience of conducting fieldwork in Corsica and to some of the ways in which I tried to resolve, at the "writing up" stage, my dilemmas about how I should represent certain trends, ideas and situations in the context of a highly politicised cultural climate.

Caroline Bithell
University of Wales, Bangor
cab@tycasa.demon.co.uk

Session 5 The Balance of Power

Acoustic Ecology Within Traditional Communities: Northwest Peru

The universe in which the traditional community members of Northwest Peru live is organised according to the principles of measure, number and balanced, harmonious relation. Their expressions of music and dance pattern their environment.

The steps and musical forms with complicated structures, functions and relations in the inorganic world and in the living world are part of the picture; the other side is Belief. Upon examination of the music and dance, we can point to a realm of harmonious relations. This realm is describable in terms of diagrams, transcriptions, and visual and oral descriptions, all of which are constant. But the organising factor or belief system assigned to each sound and movement is also describable.

It is necessary to describe these forms with new ideas. The very concept of space is enlarged, for the dance and music forms are shown to contain more than the mere outward three-dimensional space. Whether we name it “spiritual space,” the “etheric world,” or even a “fourth dimension”—the exact term does not matter—we begin to see with the eyes of a higher level of intelligence. A bridge is built between art and science, leading to a growing interpenetration of the aesthetic sense, such as a scientific mind will require.

Nancy Schaeffer
University of Texas
schaeffer@mail.utexas.edu

Who is Conducting the Fieldwork and What Are We Doing in the Field?: Rethinking Ethnomusicological Fieldwork

As in the history of anthropology, methods of fieldwork have played a most significant role in the development of ethnomusicology, although the balance between objective and subjective has been challenged. Through the illustration of comparative musicological fieldwork and armchair-analysis; observers-on-the-spot conducting fieldwork through correspondence with other observers; and ethnomusicological fieldwork’s participant-observation, face-to-face with the music and people being studied, this paper focuses questions on the attitudes of researchers (toward fieldwork and collecting) and the results of studies (toward problems of fact and representation). Several examples are given from both anthropologists and ethnomusicologists, such as Timothy Rice (fieldwork at home), George E. Marcus (ethnography in the modern world system), Walter L. Williams (being gay doing research) and my personal experiences (multi-identities in the field), on the one hand, to show ethnographic fieldwork in the contemporary world, and, on the other hand, to understand the role (or roles) we are playing in ethnomusicological studies as distinct from the past. The role fieldwork can and should play may not be clear in contemporary ethnomusicology, but questions of who is conducting the fieldwork—no longer only researchers themselves but also

informants—and what are we doing in the field—there is no fact that can be represented as other than a partial truth—should be clear be clear.

Tsan-huang Tsai
University of Oxford
tsan-huang.tsai@hertford.oxford.ac.uk

Issues of Locality in the Musical Preferences of Chinese Youngsters in Kota Kinabalu (Sabah, Malaysia)

This paper investigates the notion of the "locality" in the case of the Chinese youngsters in Kota Kinabalu (Sabah, Malaysia). Although Chinese are normally thought to actively maintain most of their cultural manifestations, there is almost no traditional Chinese music among this community. What we tend to find is Western music. Taking the three aspects of locality—West, Chinese culture and the geographical location (Malaysia)—the paper seeks to access the meaning and significance of music.

A large number of Chinese arrived in North Borneo (the former name of Sabah) during the early twentieth century. Most of them were rural poor from the south of China. It is clear that traditional Chinese music was not typical of their cultural life before, during and after their settlement in Sabah. I suggest that following much culture contact with local populations and Europeans, although the Chinese have assimilated to some extent to the local community, they have maintained and in some cases re-created their identity as Chinese using various means.

Summary of two surveys is provided. The first survey was done with about one hundred 17-year-olds from a private co-ed Chinese school, and the second one collected from Malaysians of various backgrounds via the internet.

David Wong
University of Sheffield
dtww2@hermes.cam.ac.uk

The *Shiyi xian guan qinpu* (The House of Eleven Strings): An Early-Twentieth-Century *Guqin* Handbook

The *Shiyi xian guan qinpu* was compiled by Liu Tieyun (1857-1909), a minor official, entrepreneur and novelist in the last years of the Qing Dynasty. It is highly personal and does not follow the format of a typical *qinpu*. It is significant because it appears to be the only pre-modern *qinpu* which contains the work of someone who was not a literatus. It contains a selection of pieces performed by Liu's *qin* teacher Zhang Ruishan. Among these scores are two unusual versions of the well-known *qin* piece *Guangling san*, two pieces for *pipa* and *qin* together, and four *qin* pieces said to have been composed by Zhang himself. However, I have found evidence that at least one of these is

in fact taken from the *pipa* repertoire. Liu himself appears to have had a somewhat checkered career, on which his famous novel *Lao Can you ji* is partly based.

I shall introduce the content of this *qin* handbook and the life of its author, based on my translations of the prefaces it contains and on my investigations from other sources into the life and music of Liu and Zhang, and will describe the process by which I acquired the information. I shall play one of Zhang's *qin* compositions, and, if possible, one of the pieces with *pipa* accompaniment.

Julian Joseph
jmgjoseph@aol.com

Session 6 Critiques of Fieldwork

Being a Woman and Conducting Fieldwork in Muslim Country: Pro and Contra

Muslim countries put certain restrictions for women researchers and the style of their fieldwork. A general reluctance toward being researched among peoples in rural area is still alive in countries like Uzbekistan, and was increased by Soviet-inspired suspicion of any external researchers and their explorations. It seems that only insiders from Muslim countries are likely to be welcomed to musical situations. However, a woman researcher, even one from Uzbekistan, finds herself in many difficult situations.

Two examples illustrate this point. First of all, according to Muslim law, a woman should not travel on her own but only with members of her family or at least in a group. Naturally, it may not be practicable for her family to travel everywhere with her or join in her fieldwork. This requirement essentially limits many projects in their realisation. Second, in some musical rites and rituals it is very common for people to suggest that the woman researcher should herself participate. One must always be ready to dance (in wedding parties) or to weep (in mourning rites) as a member of that society, especially in female community. So, one cannot easily stay distant, or concentrate on making audio or video recordings. Through actively paying tribute to this society, the female researcher risks missing other important aspects of performance.

As a women and a researcher in a Muslim country one has to take into account the need to accept many local customs, and follow them with firm determination. The maintenance of a strict distance between researcher and society is, however, the only way of fulfilling one's fieldwork role. This question of how the woman-researcher in Muslim countries can carry out investigations definitely deserves to be the proper object of further study itself.

Razia Sultanova
razia@sultanovar.freeserve.co.uk

Sensuality, Repression and Fieldwork

One of the more stimulating additions to the literature on anthropological fieldwork was *Taboo* (Kulick & Willson 1995): a collection of personal experiences of sexuality in the field. Themes emerging from *Taboo* included calls for the integration of emotion and intellect in ethnographic work; the inclusion of, if not sex, then sensuality in fieldwork; and—reversing the gendered critique of fieldworkers—allowing oneself to be penetrated by the field.

Arguably, this new focus on gender and sexuality and the ethnographer has particular relevance for ethnomusicologists whose field of music is so commonly associated with sexuality. Equally, it might be argued that ethnomusicologists are most strongly impelled to adopt the distanced, objective authorial stance precisely in order to defend the seriousness of their field.

Was the early ethnomusicologists' fascination with scales and classification merely a symptom of repression? Is the new reflexivity just washing dirty linen in public? And what can reflexivity really contribute to the discipline of ethnomusicology?

Rachel Harris
SOAS
rh@soas.ac.uk

Session 7 Fieldwork and Reciprocity

A Bit of Give and Take: Some Thoughts on the Importance of Giving in "the Field"

The notion of going to or being in the field in order to obtain and bring back has long been a central notion in the methods and patterns of fieldwork or field research. The ethnomusicologist has the specific aim of gathering, collecting, recording data, which will then prove useful for formulating theories, analysing patterns, producing theses: "we go to the field to bring something back: photographs, audio and video recordings, experience, knowledge, etc.. One might argue that fieldwork, despite best intentions, is a largely one-sided acquisitive enterprise" (Lysloff 1998: 190-91). But how much thought is given to ethical awareness, responsibility and reciprocity by each field researcher when planning and undertaking field research?

Although recent approaches have focused upon the two-way processes between the researcher and informants / teachers / friends, and upon a more collaborative research process, it appears that the notion of a "payback" (or a "giveback") is still not high on the agenda of those undertaking field research, nor has much discussion focused around this central issue (central to my ideological and ethical framework). Discussion which centres on applied ethnomusicology has made reference to such an aspect, "in terms of an ethical responsibility to 'pay back' those whose music and lives we study and make our livings from" (Sheehy 1992: 323) but in terms of ethnomusicological field research, rather less discussion appears to be taking place.

Ethnomusicology has, in recent decades, become both more humanistic (in binary opposition to "scientific") and reflexive (focusing on the researcher as well as the researched), however despite, or perhaps because of, such trajectories, an active dual-motivation in field research—a) to attend to academic "requirements" and b) to attend to the lives of those with whom we work in a field research context—is still not much in evidence. The main task of this paper, therefore, is to focus on the ethical responsibility of every field researcher to build payback objectives into each project, consciously seeking ways in which such a payback might happen, not as a by-product of the research process, but as a specifically designed essential component of the research process.

Discussion will also focus on notions of connectedness and reciprocity, as proposed by Jeff Todd Titon, who suggests that the ethnomusicologist's idea of his or her self should be emergent rather than autonomous and that "emergent selves… are connected selves, enmeshed in reciprocity" (Titon 1997: 99). I propose that such reciprocity should be a natural and in-built part of each field researcher's project, and although John Blacking's notion of making "some corner of the world a better place" (Blacking 1979: xxi) may perhaps seem overly naïve and philanthropic, I suggest that this is a worthy and necessary aim for each field researcher.

John Blacking, "Introduction," in John Blacking and J. Keali'inohomoku, eds., *The Performing Arts: Music and Dance* (The Hague, 1979), i-xxi.

René Lysloff, "Review Symposium: Shadows in the Field," *World of Music* 40, no. 3 (1998):143-45.

Daniel Sheehy, "A Few Notions about Philosophy and Strategy in Applied Ethnomusicology," *Ethnomusicology* 36 (1992):323-35.

Jeff Todd Titon, "Knowing Fieldwork," in Gregory F. Barz and Timothy J. Cooley, eds. *Shadows in the Field: New Perspectives for Fieldwork in Ethnomusicology* (New York, 1997), 87-100.

Ruth Hellier
University of Central England
ruthhellier@hotmail.com

Research and Reciprocity: Taking Stock of Thirty Years of Fieldwork

Social anthropologists have attached great significance to the concept of *reciprocity* as a form of cultural exchange. Recent research has extended our understanding of the term beyond studies of so-called "primitive" peoples viewed from the outside to a consideration of its meaning in certain societies in the capitalist world. This paper takes a different perspective, exploring the interaction between fieldworker and "subject" over an extended period of time, centred around an ethnographic study of carol singing in the Southern Pennines of England. It examines the negative as well as the positive aspects of the exchange with particular emphasis on mutuality. Following a consideration of ethical and moral issues such as exploitation, it develops a working model of partnership as a way forward for future productive research.

Ian Russell
University of Aberdeen

ian.russell@abdn.ac.uk

Legal Implications of Ethnomusicological Fieldwork

The 1996 *Yearbook for Traditional Music* contained several articles on the legal implications of ethnomusicological field recordings. These articles were motivated both by an admirable concern for the rights of the tradition-bearers recorded, and by practical realities. Recently it has become increasingly common for field recordings originally intended for research purposes to achieve commercial release as "world music" CDs. At the same time, the U.S. has retroactively tightened legislation protecting performers' rights, making it illegal to disseminate sound recordings without the consent of those recorded. This has produced potential legal horrors for ethnomusicologists who years ago failed to obtain releases signed by every musician present. The U.S. has already seen its first court case featuring a (foreign) ethnomusicologist caught between angry (foreign) informants and an international recording company.

The obvious solution for the fieldworker is to understand the commercial and legal situation both locally and internationally, and to obtain written and/or recorded releases for every recording made, and every photo taken. But this sometimes leads to a cultural clash—in the early 1990s I was specifically asked by Chinese colleagues not to obtain signed releases, since that was contrary to local scholarly custom and might also worry nervous local officials. I have spent much time since explaining the quaint American custom of releases so as to be able to publish my findings anywhere other than China.

It is no longer enough to enter the field with a strong ethical sense—a legal sense is now an equal pre-requisite, for everyone's protection. In addition, in some areas we must anticipate a cultural aversion to signing documents, avoid raising the hope of huge profits, and involve the local community in deciding the documents' provisions. Ethnomusicology has always been an interdisciplinary game, but the 1990s are introducing alarming new jokers into the pack.

Helen Rees
UCLA
hrees@ucla.edu

Session 8 Representation

Representing Steel Pan Musicians of Southern California: An Ethnomusicologist's Perspective as Both Insider and Outsider

The steel pan is an instrument that originated from the Caribbean islands of Trinidad and Tobago in the 1930s. Since then, the pan has eventually made its way to other parts of the world. During the 1950s-60s, many Trinidadian "panists" travelled to the United States to earn a living while also promoting their national instrument. During the 1970s-80s, Americans became more aware of the steel pan, particularly because of universities forming bands. With its good weather, easy access to beaches and various weekend activities, southern California offers many job opportunities for American and Trinidadian panists. In this paper I will not only examine who is playing pan and why but also reflect upon my role as an ethnomusicologist who is active in the tradition as it is represented in southern California. Because I have been involved in the steel pan scene for over a decade, most panists would label me as an insider. Some Trinidadians living in southern California, however, would still consider me and other Americans as outsiders. At times conducting fieldwork with such a dual identity proved to be problematic and ethically challenging. New ethnomusicologists who are eager to participate in and learn about musical traditions that have been brought abroad should be aware of the potential hazards in conducting fieldwork and how the status of "insider-outsider" can affect one's research and relationship with project participants. I suspect that as the popularity of "world music" generates more interest among scholars, and as music ownership becomes an issue of priority, the insider-outsider dichotomy will remain a relevant topic of discussion in ethnomusicology.

Gigi Lynn Rabe
UCLA, California State University Northridge
geerabe@ucla.edu

The Documentary *A Westerner Loves Our Music*: Vietnamese Representations of Fieldwork

Since the 1980s, ethnographies have, either explicitly or implicitly, paid attention to the interaction between fieldworker and "informant." Ethnographies influenced by "radical empiricism," which emphasise experience and phenomenological inquiry, are among the most experimental attempts to collapse the boundaries between experience and interpretation, the knower and the known, subject and object. Although such approaches have often been criticised as "confessional" or as lacking in empirical data (see Reily's call for "obsessional empiricism" (1998)), the best ethnomusicological examples of radical empiricism (e.g. Friedson 1996) are exemplary in the way they grapple with the nature of ethnographic knowledge and prioritise the existential characteristic of "being-with" (*mitsein*).

Rather than focusing on how fieldworkers represent themselves and the Other in ethnography, this paper examines Vietnamese representations of my research into the Vietnamese musics *ca tru* and *chau van*. Through examining the documentary called *A Westerner Loves Our Music*, made by Vietnamese Television (VTV), the paper will discuss the ways in which certain conceptions of a "Westerner"s' interest in traditional Vietnamese culture permeate the representation of my fieldwork. Although I had no editorial control over the final product, the documentary makers were familiar with approaches to ethnographic film making which endeavour to give "voice" to those being filmed (most obviously through allowing the subjects of the film to "tell their own story"). The paper will therefore examine how my own statements were understood, adopted, interpreted and edited. It will be suggested that such collaborative enterprises offer possibilities for ethnomusicologists to take notice of contrasting interpretations of fieldwork. Existentially, representations of fieldwork that are not subject to the authorial control of the fieldworker may provide fresh lines of inquiry for investigating the condition of "being-with" during fieldwork.

A Westerner Loves Our Music should be understood within the context of media censorship (and self-censorship) in Vietnam. The paper will discuss the limits of what was permitted to be shown on Vietnamese television, and how musical and ritual practices—which were vigorously prohibited until the late 1980s—are legitimated through nationalist discourse.

Barley Norton
SOAS
BN1@soas.ac.uk